National AUGUST 3, 2009 VOL. 113, NO. 29 Underwriter

To e-mail any staff member, use firstinitialastname@nuco.com, unless otherwise specified. (Example - to write John Smith, his e-mail is jsmith@nuco.com.)

EDITORIAL HEADQUARTERS

33-41 Newark St., Hoboken, NJ 07030 (201) 526-1230, Fax (201) 526-1260 Web Site: property-casualty.com

P&C GROUP EDITOR-IN-CHIEF Sam Friedman

MANAGING EDITOR Susanne Sclafane ASSISTANT MANAGING EDITOR/NU MAGAZINE Caroline McDonald ASSISTANT MANAGING EDITOR/ONLINE NEWS Daniel Hays ASSOCIATE EDITORS Agent/Broker Mark E. Ruquet, Phil Gusman **SENIOR COPY EDITOR** Kimberly Tallon **COPY EDITOR** Andres D. Diaz **EDITORIAL ASSISTANT** Michael Stanley

WASHINGTON BUREAU

1301 Connecticut Ave. N.W., Suite 300, Washington, D.C. 20036 Fax (202) 728-0510 WASHINGTON BUREAU CHIEF Arthur D. Postal (202) 728-0506

CORRESPONDENTS IN

- London

• Hamilton, Bermuda • Tallahassee, Fla. P&C GROUP PUBLISHER Christopher W. Luke (908) 859-0893

ADVERTISING SALES

MI, IN, OH Christopher W. Luke (908) 859-0893 VA, DC, EAST COAST/BERMUDA Laurel A. Metz (770) 360-9676 MIDWEST/WEST COAST Betsy Norberg (913) 400-2601 INTERNATIONAL Carolyn Hicks +44(0)20 8340 3273 MARKETPLACE/CLASSIFIED ADVERTISING Jonathan Stone (800) 933-9449 ext. 206

ADVERTISING BUSINESS DIRECTOR Sheila Hyland (859) 692-2152 ADVERTISING COORDINATOR Abby J. Schlarman (859) 692-2160 DIRECTOR OF MANUFACTURING Steve Johnston (859) 692-2116 P&C GROUP TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR Joe Haddock

PRODUCTION & DESIGN

DIRECTOR OF PRODUCTION Georgia A. Barry DESIGN DIRECTOR Donald R. Heyl ASSISTANT ART DIRECTOR Amanda B. Todd SUPERVISOR OF PRODUCTION Kimberly T. Plunkett SENIOR PRODUCTION TECHNICIAN Mark C. Joseph TECHNICIANS Amy B. Carroll, James L. Fugett, Kelly D. Meadows, Donnie Roundtree

MARKETING

P&C GROUP MARKETING DIRECTOR Andrea Shin **MARKETING MANAGER** Heather Burns

SUBSCRIPTIONS

P.O. Box 2157, Skokie, IL 60076 Customer Service Tel. (800) 458-1734 Fax: (847) 763-9587 · E-mail: propertyandcasualty@halldata.com

REPRINTS

For high-quality article reprints, including e-prints, contact: Keith Williams, PARS International Corp. 253 West 35th Street, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10001 (212) 221-9595 ext. 319 E-mail: Keith.Williams@parsintl.com

PUBLISHED BY

THE NATIONAL UNDERWRITER CO., 5081 Olympic Boulevard, Erlanger, KY 41018-3184 (859) 692-2100 Fax: (859) 692-2246



PRESIDENT/CEO Andrew L. Goodenough COO/CFO Thomas M. Flynn

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT/ MANAGING DIRECTOR, MEDIA DIVISION Thomas A. Fowler

Chris Moschovitis

FOUNDER William F. Reilly 1938-2008





A VIEW FROM THE PRESS BOX

Can You Sue Your CEO?

HOULD EMPLOYEES dumped in mass layoffs have the right to sue CEOs for executive malpractice? That was the intriguing question raised in a recent episode of ABC's "Eli Stone."

Eli's firm filed a class action on behalf of 300 people who lost their jobs after the company dismissed its CEO for bad

management-but not before paying him over \$200 million in annual compensation and another \$43 million for severance.

The TV judge dismissed the initial suit, ruling the company has no liability for firing at-will employees to pay its bills-including a golden parachute for the CEO who ran the firm into the ground.

But then Eli had a vision, inspiring him to direct his clients' wrath at the dismissed CEO, who was sued under a novel legal concept, "executive malpractice."

"People sue their doctors when they botch a procedure. They sue their lawyers

when they botch a case. Why shouldn't they also be able to sue their bosses when they screw up?" argued Eli's partner. "CEOs owe a fiduciary duty to stockholders. Why shouldn't they owe the same to their employees?" The judge certified the class and allowed the case to proceed.

For more on the actual testimony, check out my July 14 blog. But for now, let's focus on the closing arguments.

"Have you been to the doctor lately?" the defense attorney asked the jury. "Are you aware of the needless tests to shield them from malpractice lawsuits? Do you really want corporate executives to be held to the same second-guessing in courtrooms? Do you know what that would do to America's ability to compete in the global market?"

She went on to argue that "if you take away the golden parachute, how will you attract qualified executives to run the companies that give us our jobs?" Her conclusion was ominous: "To give [Eli



To respond to Sam Friedman's column, e-mail sfriedman@nuco.com, go to his blog at www.NUSamSoapbox.com, or follow him on Twitter at twitter.com/NUSam.

Stone] what he's asking for today could cost you your job tomorrow!"

Eli's team argued that "plaintiffs didn't 'lose' their jobs. An incompetent CEO lost their jobs for them."

Mr. Stone's associate told the jury that since "the vast majority of us depend on CEOs for our livelihoods, why shouldn't

> the law hold them to the same standard of care as doctors and lawyers and stockbrokers, accountants and engineers? Why shouldn't CEOs be held to the same basic standard of competence you're held to in your jobs?"

This whole concept of executive malpractice is fascinating. Is this fictional case preposterous, or might Eli be onto something? With millions being laid off-sometimes due to inept and even reckless decisions on credit default swaps, subprime mortgages and other risky financial bets-and with job prospects grim this year and

next, such legal questions might be more than academic before long.

What might the exposure implications be for risk managers and their directors and officers insurers? Might there be an opportunity for carriers to create an entirely new class of professional liability coverage? Or is this just the cockamamie delusion of a hack Hollywood scriptwriter?

The jury in Eli's case came down in favor of the plaintiffs. While granting an inconsequential economic judgment, they tacked on \$220 million in punitive damages-essentially ordering the disgraced CEO to turn over his pay to those who lost their jobs because of his alleged incompetence.

The verdict certainly felt cathartic, but would it hold up on appeal? Does the entire concept of executive malpractice have a leg to stand on? What do you folks think?

> Sam Friedman Editor In Chief